

QUALITY EDUCATION AS A POTENTIAL FOR ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT

ZHUMAGULOVA A.B.*¹
Candidate of Juridical Sciences

YANOVSKAYA O.A.*¹
Doctor of Economic Sciences, Professor

¹Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating, Astana, Republic of Kazakhstan

ABSTRACT. The article discusses the impact of the quality of education on the development of the economy. Human resources are the main potential of the state and the economic growth of the country depends on the level of their development. Improving the quality and competitiveness of educational services is becoming an important priority of the time. The purpose of the study is to study approaches to the effective use of internal and external resources to ensure access to quality education as a tool for sustainable economic development. The methodology of the study of education quality and its impact on economic growth is based on the methods of external assessment of the level of educational services and comparative analysis of the promotion of education quality culture in the conditions of transformation of the education system.

KEYWORDS: quality of education, economic growth, human resources, international accreditation, rating

САПАЛЫ БІЛІМ ЭКОНОМИКАЛЫҚ ДАМУ ӘЛЕУЕТІ РЕТІНДЕ

ЖҰМАҒҰЛОВА А.Б.*¹
заң ғылымдарының кандидаты

ЯНОВСКАЯ О.А.*¹
экономика ғылымдарының докторы, профессор

¹Аккредиттеу және рейтингтің тәуелсіз агенттігі, Астана қ., Қазақстан Республикасы

АҢДАТПА. Мақалада білім беру сапасының экономиканың дамуына әсері қарастырылады. Адами ресурстар мемлекеттің басты әлеуеті болып табылады және елдің экономикалық өсуі олардың даму деңгейіне байланысты. Білім беру қызметінің сапасы мен бәсекеге қабілеттілігін арттыру уақыттың маңызды басымдығына айналып отыр. Зерттеудің мақсаты – тұрақты экономикалық даму құралы ретінде сапалы білімге қолжетімділікті қамтамасыз ету үшін ішкі және сыртқы ресурстарды тиімді пайдалану тәсілдерін зерт-

теу. Білім беру сапасын және оның экономикалық өсуге әсерін зерттеу әдістемесі білім беру жүйесінің трансформациясы жағдайында білім беру қызметтерінің деңгейін сырттай бағалау және сапалы білім беру мәдениетін көтеруді салыстырмалы талдау әдістеріне негізделген.

ТҮЙІН СӨЗДЕР: білім сапасы, экономикалық өсу, адам ресурстары, халықаралық аккредитация, рейтинг

КАЧЕСТВЕННОЕ ОБРАЗОВАНИЕ КАК ПОТЕНЦИАЛ РАЗВИТИЯ ЭКОНОМИКИ

ЖУМАГУЛОВА А.Б.*¹

кандидат юридических наук

ЯНОВСКАЯ О.А.*¹

доктор экономических наук, профессор

¹Независимое агентство аккредитации и рейтинга, г. Астана, Республика Казахстан

АННОТАЦИЯ. В статье рассматриваются вопросы влияния качества образования на развитие экономики. Человеческие ресурсы являются главным потенциалом государства и от уровня их развития зависит экономический рост страны. Повышение качества и конкурентоспособности образовательных услуг становится важным приоритетом времени. Цель исследования - изучение подходов эффективного использования внутренних и внешних ресурсов обеспечения доступа к качественному образованию, как инструменту устойчивого развития экономики. Методология исследования качества образования и его влияния на экономический рост основана на методах внешней оценки уровня образовательных услуг и сравнительном анализе продвижения культуры качества образования в условиях трансформации системы образования.

КЛЮЧЕВЫЕ СЛОВА: качество образования, экономический рост, человеческие ресурсы, международная аккредитация, рейтинг

INTRODUCTION. Quality education is the foundation of progress and economic development of any country. One of the key reference points of HEIs in Central Asian countries is to increase the competitiveness of educational services. In the era of digitalisation, the comprehensive development of the education system requires a global transformation aimed at improving the quality of higher education and the responsibility of higher education institutions for proper personnel training.

Education is one of the priority spheres determining the development of a country; it can accelerate the achievement of all sustainable development goals and is therefore a key element of countries' development strategies. In modern conditions, the development of the state is directly dependent on the potential of human resources, and this, in turn, requires the enhancement of the education system.

In these conditions, one of the key features of the current situation becomes a deep understanding of the world mission

of education. Given the current trends, it is necessary to move from "education - learning" to "education - formation and development of personality".

At present, an effective mechanism to address the global issues of the century is education aimed at developing human resources for economic growth.

The development of competences and skills becomes fundamental in learning in order to build a trajectory of continuous lifelong learning. The indicators of the level of knowledge and competences are not the number of learners but the quality of learning.

In this regard, special attention is paid to quality assurance of graduates' training. Therefore, it is relevant to increase the role of external quality assessment of higher education institutions and the importance of international accreditation, as well as rating ranking.

MATERIALS AND METHODS OF RESEARCH.

The research is conditioned by the economic challenges of society, national and international requirements to improve the competitiveness of educational organisations in order to fill the labour market with qualified specialists.

The set issues of determining the relationship between quality education and growth of economic development were considered on the basis of in-depth study and comprehensive tools. The research applied various methods and types of analysis: descriptive, systematic review, comparative and empirical, which enabled to identify the guidelines for quality assurance of education to improve the efficiency of economic growth.

RESULTS AND THEIR DISCUSSION. The quality of education is a set of indicators that characterise certain aspects of educational services: essential content, forms and methods of education, teaching staff, material and technical base, which ensures the development of skills and competencies of the learner. According to the results of the study, the most important in quality assurance of education are economic factors: qualification of teaching staff

(36%), the level of implementation of innovative technologies and material and technical base (72%).

Quality, as noted by Ozhegov S.I. - is a set of basic signs, features, characteristics and properties that distinguish a phenomenon or object from others, which gives a specific certainty. [1]

According to ESG and ISO quality standards, the concept of quality is compliance with established requirements, certain characteristics and objectives. Some foreign scientists - Abad-Segura, Estin, Crozier, Campbell, Dill consider quality as a process of change and transformation, and Stensaker B., Sluismans D. consider quality through the process of management. [2,3]

A number of scholars Juran, Harvey and Green consider quality as the result of meeting the needs of industry and society.[4] B.Jessop considers quality as a measure taken for improvement. [5]

Globally education has received considerable attention in recent decades. According to research by the British National Foundation, learning outcomes have not changed over the last half century, although the cost per learner has steadily increased (in Australia it has increased threefold, in the USA twofold). Solving the question of how to influence learning outcomes remains one of the topical economics of education.

Today the external assessment of educational organisations and educational programmes by independent agencies is of great importance. Let us consider the issues of external quality assurance of education on the example of the leading international agency - Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating (IAAR), established in 2011 to improve the system of quality assurance of education.

Thus, implementing its mission, IAAR carries out continuous support and promotion of quality culture aimed at increasing the competitiveness of education and attractiveness of educational programmes of higher education institutions.

The strategic guidelines, as experience shows, are aimed at strengthening the status of a recognised, internationally competitive Quality Assurance Agency for Education. IAAR always strives for high development result and effective capacity growth in promoting a culture of quality in education.

Since 2017, the Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating has been recognised in the Republic of Kazakhstan, the Kyrgyz Republic and included in the National Registers of Accreditation Agencies of the Ministries of these countries.

IAAR activity is implemented according to the objectives of the national education system development, specified in the programme documents and carried out in accordance with the Concept of higher education and science development in the Republic of Kazakhstan for 2023 - 2029. [6]

In its work the Agency always takes into account the legislation in the field of education and educational policy of the Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the European Higher Education Area.

The Agency carries out institutional and specialised (programme) international accreditation of HEIs in 15 countries of Central Asia, Europe and America: Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Russia, Tajikistan, Belarus, Uzbekistan, Azerbaijan, Armenia, Ukraine, Moldova, Palestine, Switzerland, Romania, Dominica, Barbados (Figure 1).

The agency's external quality assessment of education is based on the key principles of international accreditation:

- independence, voluntariness, objectivity and professionalism
- transparency, publicity and credibility
- relevance and openness of information
- collegiality of decision-making.

IAAR is the first organisation from the CIS countries to be recognised by the World Federation for Medical Education (WFME), which gives it the right to conduct international

accreditation of medical organisations and educational programmes.

All medical schools that have passed the international accreditation of IAAR are eligible for ECFMG (Educational Commission for Foreign Medical Graduates) certification to obtain a licence to work abroad.

The analysis showed that the IAAR is a full member of the European Association for Quality Assurance in Higher Education (ENQA) and is also included in the European Quality Assurance Register for Higher Education (EQAR), which allows to carry out international accreditation of HEIs. Therefore, HEIs accredited by the IAAR are automatically included in the international DEQAR database. As a result, international applicants and students choose accredited HEIs for their studies.

This makes it possible to improve the image and recognition of HEIs in the global educational space, to expand internationalisation and academic mobility of students and teachers, and to attract more international students to the country's HEIs.

Thanks to its full membership in international European networks, HEIs accredited by this agency receive international accreditation status. IAAR is a full member of European, Asian and American networks and quality assurance and accreditation agencies: International Network for Quality Assurance Agencies in Higher Education (INQAAHE), International Quality Group of the Council for Higher Education Accreditation in the United States (CIQG, CHEA); International Observatory for Academic Ranking and Excellence (IREG); Association of Quality Assurance Agencies of the Islamic World (IQA); Central and Eastern European Network of Quality Assurance Agencies in Higher Education (CEENQA); Asia-Pacific Quality Network (APQN); Asia-Pacific Quality Register (APQR).

International accreditation of IAAR is conducted according to the world Standards, harmonised and compliant with the European Standards of Quality - ESG, and for medical

universities and educational programmes according to the Standards of the World Federation for Medical Education (WFME), ensuring a high level of quality of education.

For the international accreditation procedure, the IAAR attracts foreign experts, which allows, based on foreign experience, a more objective external evaluation of the quality of educational programmes. As of today, the base of international experts is over 4000 people from 39 countries of the world, which is constantly expanding. The Agency organises annual free training seminars to improve the qualification of experts.

The procedure of external evaluation of educational organisations includes the following main stages:

- submitting an application;
- admission to accreditation once compliance with the requirements has been established;
- self-evaluation of the organisation and/or educational programme;
- preparing an external expert commission for a visit to the organisation;
- external expert commission visit to the educational organisation;
- decision on accreditation of the organisation and/or programme.

The empirical analysis of the report of the external expert commission on the results of quality assessment of the educational organisation for compliance with the standards of international institutional accreditation allowed to identify the total volume of recommendations on quality improvement.

In order to further ensure that HEIs meet the criteria of the international institutional accreditation standards, it can be seen that the highest percentage of recommendations are given by experts for improving strategic development, faculty, student-centred learning, monitoring and evaluation of the core educational programme, research and development and public awareness.

In connection with the above, it is important to note that to ensure the quality of higher

education both in Kazakhstan and in the countries of the Central Asian region:

1. When developing educational programmes, HEIs need to really involve stakeholders, which will allow to take into account employers' requirements to graduates, and most importantly - to guarantee their employment in the labour market.

2. Special disciplines in HEIs should be taught by practitioners, employees of partner companies.

3. Expand internationalisation both outside and within the country.

4. Increase the development of individualisation of educational services and result-oriented learning.

This will effectively affect both the quality of graduates and their competitiveness and demand in the labour market. And thus, it will allow to form a resource potential for accelerated growth of the economy of the countries, for the benefit of the development of the countries of Central Asia and Europe.

International accreditation by IAAR gives HEIs a competitive advantage:

- Providing image, credibility and status.
- International Seal of Educational Quality, recognition and recognisability.
- Integration into the world educational space.
- Entering the global higher education market.
- Comparability and convertibility of diplomas, qualifications.
- Increases the competitiveness of graduates, their demand in the labour market and employment rate.
- Attracting and increasing the number of international applicants and students.
- Opportunities for students to continue their studies at international universities without additional study.

In the modern world, not only external evaluation of educational organisations (international accreditation), but also the competitive advantage of higher education



Figure 1 - IAAR Cross-Border Accreditation

institutions, which is determined by the position in the Ranking, plays an important role. The concept of "rating" comes from the English word "rate", translated as "evaluation". Let us explore in more detail the emergence of this concept in the literature.

Thus, one group of researchers Raizberg E.A., Karminskiy A.M., Drozdova M.I. in defining the category "rating" adheres to the concepts: indicator, characteristic, state of the object, assessment on a scale, position in the classification. [7,8]

The second group of scientists - Zimin V.A., Kovalev V.V., Volkova O.N., in the concept of "rating" put ways and methods of analysing objects, for example: ordering, lining up, arrangement, determination of rank. [9,10]

Interpretation of the concept of "rating assessment" as noted by Nosov V.V. and Umanskaya O.P. - is an integrated indicator that allows ranking subjects in a particular sequence. [11]

Thus, the rating is understood not as an evaluation, but as a "process" of aligning subjects by evaluative features. Based on

the analysis, it is important to note that the presented concepts of rating allow us to establish a logical connection and contribute to the understanding of the essence and more accurate definition in economic research.

As a specific evaluative characteristic, a ranking and ranking score refers to the result of the analysis performed.

It is important to note that since 2014, IAAR has been conducting the Rankings, which have become increasingly important in the academic world and are of great interest to society today. The IAAR Rankings are an important tool for effective management of the higher education system and a technology that allows assessing the competitiveness of higher education institutions.

Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating is the 5th organisation in the world whose methodology has successfully passed the audit of the International Observatory on Academic Ranking and Excellence IREG and received the European recognition of IREG and the high Quality Mark "IREG Approved". This means that the University Rankings conducted

by IAAR are fully compliant with international standards and orientate HEIs to improve the quality of education.

Today, the IAAR Ranking has become a popular and important annual event in the academic community, which is confirmed by the constant growth in the number of participants - higher education institutions. The IAAR Ranking promotes the competitiveness of educational services, ensures public awareness of the compliance of the quality of education with the requirements of the labour market and takes into account the peculiarities of the education system development.

The annual IAAR Ranking of HEIs, which has been conducted annually for a number of years, takes into account the main areas of activity of educational institutions: quality of education, level of scientific research, potential of teachers, demand and competitiveness of graduates in the labour market. The ranking helps to raise the prestige of universities and increase the attractiveness of their educational programmes.

Independent Ranking of HEIs is conducted on a digital platform. According to the methodology of the IAAR Ranking, HEIs independently enter information about their achievements and are responsible for the objective filling in of indicators. Therefore, the university's position in the Ranking depends on the completeness and correctness of data entry. This indicates the transparency and objectivity of the Ranking.

The main criterion for assessing the success of HEIs is the employment and placement of graduates. An important indicator of the activity of higher education institutions of the country is their demand in the labour market.

Today it is important to adapt the education system to the needs of the digital society, aimed at obtaining quality knowledge and creative thinking skills, as new-format specialists are required nowadays. There is a need to develop new educational programmes, introduce innovative methods and approaches to learning.

The results of the Independent Ranking of HEIs are the basis for quality assurance

and improving the competitiveness of HEIs, strengthening the position of universities in the education market, attracting talented applicants and expanding the export of educational services.

Starting from 2020, IAAR conducts the International Ranking "Eurasian University Ranking IAAR EUR" of the best higher education institutions of the Eurasian space.

International ranking of the Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating - "IAAR Eurasian University Ranking" is an important and significant recognition for the Eurasian educational space. Participation of HEIs in the IAAR EUR international ranking is becoming the main competitive advantage and a kind of Quality mark. The peculiarity of the IAAR international ranking is the focus on high quality education as a priority vector of HEI development.

HEIs of Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Russia, Tajikistan, Azerbaijan, Belarus, Moldova, Ukraine take part in the IAAR Eurasian University Ranking (IAAR-EUR), which shows the prestige and popularity of the International Ranking in the academic community.

Participation in the International Ranking IAAR-EUR allows HEIs to assess the competitiveness of universities according to the latest global trends, attract more foreign applicants, increase the level of internationalisation of education, raise the image and prestige of HEIs and the country as a whole.

The International Ranking of HEIs "IAAR Eurasian University Ranking" positions the quality of education and intellectual potential of HEIs in the international market of educational services. Entering the Rankings and being in the Top-List is an indicator of high competitiveness of HEIs.

IAAR EUR International Ranking indicators are the following key trends of modern education: quality of education (20%), scientific potential (30%), integration of HEI into the world educational space (20%), academic reputation of HEI (30%).

IAAR International Ranking allows to raise the image and reputation of HEIs, expand opportunities for international cooperation and competitive advantages in the market of educational services, attract talented applicants and students. International Ranking "IAAR Eurasian University Ranking" is conducted with the purpose of:

- Improving the competitiveness of higher education institutions.
- Attracting the best international students and faculty to universities.
- Developing internationalisation and academic mobility.
- Using the results of the Ranking by state authorities to improve the mechanisms of education system management.
- Increasing communication of HEIs with different target audiences.
- Stimulating and motivating information openness of HEIs.
- Promoting competition between HEIs.

The IAAR Rankings are not only a reference point for applicants and parents when choosing HEI, but are also demanded by employers, the government and the academic community [12].

The results of the International Ranking "IAAR Eurasian University Ranking" demonstrate that all criteria are key factors in improving the competitiveness of HEIs. Employers, state authorities, applicants, students and all interested parties have the opportunity to get the necessary information about HEIs.

Rankings of higher education institutions conducted by IAAR have become a barometer for determining the level of quality of education and an important component of the national educational environment, while international accreditation has become an important mechanism for improving the quality of education and educational programmes.

CONCLUSION. Quality assurance in education and trajectories of training learners in accordance with the world standards is becoming an important vector of strategic development of HEIs of the republic and constructive interaction between the academic community and the international labour market, which positively affects the development of human resources of the country. Education is an intensive factor of economic growth. Thus, the level of education of the nation directly affects economic growth.

REFERENCES:

1. Ozhegov, S.I. & Shvedova, N.Ju. (1994). *Tolkovyj slovar'* (2nd ed.). Moskva: Az.
2. Abad, S. & González, Z. (2020). Ustojchivoje upravlenie cifrovoj transformaciej v vysshem obrazovanii: issledovatel'skie tendencii [Sustainable Management of Digital Transformation in Higher Education: Research Trends]. *Ustojchivoje razvitie*, 12, 2107.
3. Stensaker, B. (2015). Organizacionnaja identichnost' kak koncepcija dlja ponimanija dinamiki universiteta [Organizational identity as a concept for understanding University dynamics]. *Higher education*, 69(1), 103-115. DOI:10. 1007/s10734-014-9763-8
4. Juran, J. M. & Gryna, F.M. (1988). *Quality-control handbook*. McGraw-Hill, New York.
5. Jessop, B. (2018). On academic capitalism. *Critical policy studies*, 12(1), 104-109. <http://doi.org/10.1080/19460171.2017.1403342>
6. Postanovlenie Pravitel'stva Respubliki Kazahstan, № 248. (2023, March 28). *Concept of higher education and science development in the Republic of Kazakhstan for 2023 – 2029*.

-
7. Rajzberg, B.A. & Starodubceva, E.B. (2021). *Kurs jekonomiki: uchebnik* (B.A. Rajzberg, Ed). M: INFRA-M.
 8. Karminskij, A.M. (2015). *Kreditnye rejtingi i ih modelirovanie*. Nac. issled. un-t «Vysshaja shkola jekonomiki». M.: Izd. dom Vysshej shkoly jekonomiki.
 9. Zimin, V.A (2021). *Uchebnoe posobie: Vvedenie v jekonomiku*. Samara: Izdatel'stvo OOO «Nauchno-tehnicheskij centr».
 10. Kovalev, V.V. & Volkova, O.N. (2019). *Analiz hozjajstvennoj dejatel'nosti predpriyatija: Uchebnik*. M.: Izdatel'stvo Prospekt.
 11. Nosov, V.V. & Umanskaja, O.P. (2011). Rejtingovaja ocenka dejatel'nosti organizacij. *Sibirskaja finansovaja shkola*, 38 - 42.
 12. Zhumagulova, A.B. (2024). Normative-legal aspects of promoting a culture of academic integrity in the conditions of knowledge economy development. *Education. Quality Assurance*, 1(34), 8-15.

СВЕДЕНИЯ ОБ АВТОРАХ:

Zhumagulova Alina* - Candidate of Juridical Sciences, General Director, Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating (IAAR), Astana, Republic of Kazakhstan
E-mail: iaar@iaar.kz

Yanovskaya Olga* - Doctor of Economic Sciences, Professor, PhD, Academician, Advisor to the General Director, Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating (IAAR), Astana, Republic of Kazakhstan
E-mail: yanovskaya_o@mail.ru

Жұмағұлова Алина Бақытжанқызы* - заң ғылымдарының кандидаты, бас директор, Аккредиттеу және рейтинг тәуелсіз агенттігі (IAAR), Астана қ., Қазақстан Республикасы
E-mail: iaar@iaar.kz

Яновская Ольга Алексейқызы* - экономика ғылымдарының докторы, профессор, академик, бас директорының кеңесшісі, Аккредиттеу және рейтингтің тәуелсіз агенттігі (IAAR), Астана қ., Қазақстан Республикасы
E-mail: yanovskaya_o@mail.ru

Жумагулова Алина Бакытжановна* - кандидат юридических наук, генеральный директор Независимого агентства аккредитации и рейтинга (IAAR), г. Астана, Республика Казахстан
E-mail: iaar@iaar.kz

Яновская Ольга Алексеевна* - доктор экономических наук, профессор, академик, Советник генерального директора, Независимое агентство аккредитации и рейтинга (IAAR), г. Астана, Республика Казахстан
E-mail: yanovskaya_o@mail.ru